

Standard setting report
Laporan Penyusunan Standar

2017-08-01

**Development of Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001, Annex 3 IFCC ST 1002
and IFCC PD 1005**

***Penyusunan Lampiran 4 IFCC ST 1001, Lampiran 3 IFCC ST
1002, dan IFCC PD 1005***



Indonesian Forestry Certification Cooperation (IFCC)
Perkumpulan Kerjasama Sertifikasi Kehutanan Indonesia (KSK)

1 Introduction

On the 1st of October 2014, the IFCC scheme for sustainable forest management was officially endorsed by PEFC Council, and those were 12 (twelve) documents endorsed by PEFC Council where 2 (two) of them are IFCC ST 1001 (IFCC Requirements for Sustainable Forest Management/SFM) and IFCC ST 1002 (IFCC Requirements for Bodies Providing Audit and Certification of Sustainable Forest Management).

The above documents have been able for implementation by Forest Management Units (FMU) that have been granted a license for wood utilization both in natural forest and industrial plantation forest, by the Government of Indonesia.

In the middle of its journey, IFCC sees that there is a potential market demand for producing internationally certified forest based products that are sourced from community forest in Indonesia. Nevertheless, after review and discussion by IFCC Technical Team, IFCC concludes that the current endorsed IFCC SFM Standards are not fully able for implementation in the community forest in Indonesia. This is due to specific characteristics embedded on the community forest in Indonesia. Therefore, to make the IFCC ST 1001 enable for full implementation in the community forest, IFCC needs to develop additional annex which describe specific requirements for audit and certification of sustainable community forest management in Indonesia.

2 Scope of the standard setting process and this report

The formal start of the annex 4 setting process was approved by IFCC Board of Director on 19th May 2015.

This report is based on the requirement of the IFCC standard setting procedures (IFCC PD 1001).

The scope of the standard setting activities was focused on:

- a) The development of Sustainable Community Forest Management Certification - Requirements (Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001);
- b) The development of Specific Requirements for Bodies Providing Audit and Certification of Sustainable Community Forest Management (Annex 3 IFCC ST 1002);
- c) The development of IFCC Procedures for Group Forest Management (IFCC PD 1005).

The standard setting work was based on and governed by IFCC PD 1001, *Standard setting procedures* and shall be open, transparent, and consensus based.

This standard setting report is based on chapter 5.6.1 of IFCC PD 1001.

2.1 IFCC specific standard, procedure and documents

The development of the IFCC specific standard, procedure and documents covered the following requirements:

- a) Requirements for sustainable community forest management (SCFM);
- b) Requirements for certification bodies operating SCFM;
- c) Procedure for group forest management.

3 Governance of the revision process

In accordance with IFCC PD 1001 the following organizational arrangements were applied for the revision of the scheme:

3.1 IFCC General Assembly (the GA)

The GA was responsible for the formal approval of the scheme's standards (IFCC PD 1001).

3.2 IFCC Board of Directors (the BoD)

The BoD fulfilled the following functions in the standard setting process:

- Approval of the project proposal^[2.1];
- Establishment and dissolution of the Standardization Committee;
- Recommendation of the final draft (FD) standards for formal approval by the GA.

3.3 Standardization Committee (the SC)

The SC who worked on develop the standard is the same SC that was established by the BoD on 15 May 2012. It was stated on the project proposal that was approved by BoD meeting on 19th May 2015, considering that the member of the SC are capable to maintain that the standard of SCFM is having the same spirit with the previous endorsed SFM standard.

The SC representations are the following stakeholder categories:

- a) Business and industry relating to forest based products;
- b) Forest owners / managers;
- c) Indigenous people and local populations;
- d) Non-governmental organization, in particular environmental organizations;
- e) Scientific and technological community;
- f) Women, children and youth;
- g) Workers and trade unions;
- h) Governmental authorities, including national, regional and local authorities.

The SC is also balanced concerning (i) the main stakeholders social, environmental and economic interests and (ii) national and local representation.

The SC reports to the BoD; and the BoD can dissolve the SC at any time.

3.4 Drafting Working Group (DWG)

The DWG was an informal group of the SC that supported the SC in between the meetings by analyzing suggestions and comments of stakeholders within and outside the SC and by preparing draft documentation for the SC meetings.

3.5 IFCC Secretariat (the Secretariat)

The Secretariat was responsible for the implementation of the standard setting procedures (IFCC PD 1001). The Secretariat arranged all contacts between the SC, the DWG and the BoD. In particular, the Secretariat was responsible for:

- a) Preparation of the project development process and project proposal;
- b) Providing secretarial and administration support to the SC and DWG;
- c) Announcing the start of the development process;
- d) Administration of the public consultation;
- e) Organizing of public seminars;
- f) Publication of the approved documentation.

4 Description of the process

In Jan 2015, the IFCC formally started the development of the Annex 4 IFCC standard for Community Forest.

The process consisted of 6 stages as defined by IFCC PD 1001: proposal stage, preparatory stage, technical committee stage, enquiry stage, pilot testing, formal approval stage and publication stage.

Standard setting stages		Responsibility
Proposal stage , Jan - May 2015	Project development/pengembangan proposal	The Secretariat
	Project approval/persetujuan	BoD
Preparatory stage , Oct 2015 - June 2016 and Apr - June 2017	SC establishment	BoD
	Development of working drafts	The Secretariat
	Public announcement of start of the annex 4 Standardization Committee process	The Secretariat
SC stage , August 2016 - April 2017	Consideration of comments	SC (supported by the DWG and the Secretariat)
	Consensus building	SC
Enquiry stage , Sept 2016 - March 2017	Public consultation	The Secretariat
Pilot testing , March 2017	Testing of Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001, and Annex 3 IFCC ST 1002	AJA Registrars, Farmers Group Jabung Jaya Bersama; The Secretariat
Approval stage , April 2017 and July 2017	Standard setting report	The Secretariat
	Board of Directors recommendation / approval	BoD
	General Assembly approval	GA
Publication stage Aug 2017	Publication of the documentation	The Secretariat

4.1 Summary of the process

The SC has met 3 times in person^[3.1-3.9]; members of the SC were always invited in advance. The meetings were recorded in the minutes from the meetings.

The DWG has met 4 times in person^[4.1-4.10]. The minutes of the DWG meetings were recorded in minutes.

Enquiry draft of the document was sent for public consultation that was organized during September 2016 - March 2017^[6.2-6.7]. IFCC has organized one public meeting in Jogjakarta in October 2016^[2.2-2.3]. All comments were analyzed and considered by the DWG and the SC ^[1.1].

The draft community forest management requirement was tested in a pilot testing^[2.4]. Feedback from the pilot testing was considered by the DWG and the SC.

The SC has reached consensus on the final drafts and recommended them for a formal approval by the IFCC^[3.7-3.9].

4.2 Standard setting process

The detail of the standard setting process divided into 6 phases as presented below.

Phase 1: Proposal stage (January - May 2015)

Purpose	Activities	Outputs
To define the scope, basic principles and phases of the process	Preparation and approval of the project proposal	Project Proposal

Project proposal

The Secretariat prepared a project proposal paper^[2.1] which defined the scope, basic principles, phases, responsibilities and timetable of the process.

The document was presented to the BoD and adopted at its meeting on 19th May 2015^[5.1].

Phase 2: Preparatory stage (October 2015 - June 2016 and April - June 2017)

Purpose	Activities	Outputs
To develop the first draft standard, announce the SC process	Approval of Standardization Committee by BoD Preparation of the first draft standards	Approval of BoD for The SC The enquiry Draft of the annex 4 (August 2016); draft of the IFCC PD 1005 (June 2017)

Approval of the SC

Considering that the IFCC SC were established on 15 May 2012, the BoD approved them to develop the requirement of community forest management certification^[2.1]. The SC consisted of 39 members that represented 8 stakeholder's groups

Preparation of draft standards

In the first quarter of 2015 IFCC received information with regards to PEFC Collaboration Fund Project 2015. IFCC considered that this project can be channeled to finance the completion of sustainable community forest management working draft. As such, the time schedule to complete the working draft were adjusted with the timeline of PEFC Collaboration Fund 2015 where it was started on 1st October 2015.

On 2nd August 2016, the SC officially received the working draft from IFCC Team (PEFC Collaboration Fund 2015 Project Team); and they treated the draft as draft "0" (zero). The IFCC Secretariat made a public announcement with regards to the above SC process, then followed by creating first draft of Annex 4 of IFCC ST 1001 and Annex 3 of IFCC ST 1002 by IFCC Secretariat and the SC.

Phase 3: Standardization Committee Stage (2 August 2016 - 13 April 2017)

Purpose	Activities	Outputs
To build consensus on final drafts	The SC met three times and reached consensus on the content of Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001 and Annex 3 IFCC ST 1002 documents. The SC was supported by the DWG.	Final drafts

Summary of the SC meetings

The SC started its work at its meeting held on **2nd August 2016**^[3.1-3.3]. The purpose of the meeting was (i) to receive the Draft "0" of CFMS from IFCC Team; (ii) to discuss the Draft "0" of CFMS to be the first Draft; (iii) to establish the DWG who will support the SC.

The second meeting held on **30th August 2016**^[3.4-3.6] discussed in detail the second Draft IFCC CFMS (Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001) that have been discussed by DWG. The SC agreed to send Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001, draft 1.3. for two-months public consultation.

The third meeting held on **13 April 2017**^[3.7-3.9] discussed the Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001 and the Annex 3 IFCC ST 1002 and agreed (reached consensus) on those standards to be formally approved by IFCC. At this meeting the SC also considered comments from the public consultation (September 2016 - March 2017). The SC also considered results of the pilot testing.

Management of the SC

The members of the SC received in advance of all meetings an invitation for the meetings^[3.1, 3.4, 3.7]. All the meeting of the SC were recorded in the minutes^[3.3, 3.6, 3.9]. Comments and suggestions received from the SC members with regards to the IFCC standards were reported in the minutes of the meetings^[3.3, 3.6, 3.9].

Drafting Working Group (DWG)

The DWG has been set up to assist the SC with drafting the IFCC standards and procedure and to prepare new drafts for the SC meetings. The DWG met on 23th – 24th August 2016^[4.1, 4.2, 4.3], 16th March 2017^[4.4, 4.5], 31st March – 1st April 2017^[4.6, 4.7], and on 9th June 2017^[4.8, 4.9, 4.10]. The list of the DWG members is shown in Annex 2 of this report.

Phase 4: Enquiry Stage (4 Sept 2016 - March 2017)

Purpose	Activities	Outputs
To consult draft requirements with broad range of stakeholders	The public consultation in 4 Sept 2016 - 16 March 2017 The public seminars as a part of public consultation in 6 Oct 2016	Stakeholders comments

Public Consultation

Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001, v.1.3 was presented for public consultation that took place from 4 September 2016 until 16 March 2017; The announcement of the public consultation was made at the IFCC website^[6.2], including the consulted standard and commenting form; The public consultation was communicated to stakeholders by a letter^[6.5] distributed to stakeholders by E-mail and by post^[6.4]. The public consultation was announced at the “rimbawan-interaktif” mailing list (media communication platform that covers forestry community : government, NGOs, industry, science) with more than 1300 members^[6.3].

During the public consultation, IFCC Secretariat has received comments^[1.1]. The comments were considered by the DWG and SC at its meeting on 13 April 2017^[3.9].

Public Seminars

As a part of the public consultation, the IFCC has run a public seminars that was conducted on 6th October 2016 in Jogjakarta. It was attended by 32 stakeholders.

Phase 5: Pilot testing (6th – 11th March 2017)

Purpose	Activities	Outputs
To test the IFCC CFMS	To test auditability and reliability of the Annex 4 IFCC 1001 and Annex 3 IFCC ST 1003 standard. To verify the standard compliance with the PEFC Council requirements.	Pilot testing report

Pilot testing

During 6th - 11th March 2017, AJA Registrars carried out a pilot audit against the Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001 and Annex 3 IFCC ST 1002. The audit took place on the farmer group “Jabung Jaya Bersama, Jambi”. The report^[2.4] from the pilot audit was considered by the DWG on 16th March 2017^[4.4, 4.5].

Phase 6: Approval stage (April and July 2017)

Purpose	Activities	Outputs
To formally adopt the requirements	The BoD recommended the Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001 and Annex 3 IFCC ST 1002 documents for formal approval/adoption The GA formally adopted the Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001 and Annex 3 IFCC ST 1002 documents The BoD approved the IFCC procedural document	

Board of Directors

On 17th April 2017, the IFCC BoD approved and recommended to the IFCC GA to formally adopt the annex 4 IFCC ST 1001 and Annex 3 IFCC ST 1002.

On July 2017, the IFCC BoD approved procedural documents IFCC PD 1005^[5.3].

General Assembly

On 18 - 25 April 2017, the IFCC BoD submit a formal letter to IFCC member related the Postal Ballot to formally adopt Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001 and Annex 3 IFCC ST 1002^[5.4].

Phase 7: Publication stage (August 2017)

Purpose	Activities	Outputs
To make the IFCC documents publicly available	To publish the IFCC documentation	IFCC documents published

Publication of the IFCC standard and standard setting report

On 1st August 2017, the IFCC published the formally approved Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001, Annex 3 IFCC ST 1002, procedural documents (PD) IFCC PD 1005, and the standard setting report at the IFCC website together with a press release ^[6.9-6.11].

Standard setting timetable

		2015				2016				2017			Week/ Minggu	
		I	II	III	IV	I	II	III	IV	I	II	III		
Prop. Stage/ Thp rancangan kegiatan	Project proposal development/ Pengembangan rancangan kegiatan	■	■											6 - 19
	Approval by BoD/persetujuan BoD		■											19
Preparatory Stage/Thp persiapan	Developing a working draft/Mengembangkan draf kerja				■	■	■	■	■			■	■	37 – 75 and 113 - 122
	SC establishment/Pendirian komite standarisasi		■											19
SC stage/Thp Komite Standar								■						81 - 84
Enquiry stage/Thp pertanyaan/ penyelidikan	Public and members consultation/ Konsultasi publik dan anggota							■	■	■	■	■	■	85 - 111
	Direct consultation with stakeholders/ Konsultasi langsung dengan stakeholders								■					89
	Processing and consideration of comments/ Memproses dan mempertimbangkan komentar										■	■		111 - 114
	Pilot testing/uji coba										■			109 - 110
Appr. Stage/Thp persetujuan	Board meeting/Pertemuan Badan Pengurus											■	■	115 and 127 - 128
	General Assembly/Rapat Umum Anggota											■		115 - 116
Publication stage/Thp publikasi													■	129

5 Evidence on consensus reached

5.1 Consensus building

Following the IFCC standard setting procedures (*IFCC PD 1001*), the primary body for reaching consensus on the standards of the scheme is the Standardization Committee (the SC).

The SC decision on the final drafts' approval

The SC meeting of 13th April 2017^[3.10-3.12] reached consensus on the final draft standards (Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001 and Annex 3 IFCC ST 1002).

The meeting was attended by 29 members (out of 39 total members) of the SC and all of them voted in favor of the standards to be approved by the IFCC^[3.13].

The SC therefore reached consensus as defined by IFCC PD1001:

- More than 70 % of all members voted in favor;
- There was no sustained opposition presented by any member of the SC.

Annex 1: List of available documentation

1. Lists of comments

- (1.1) Public comments

2. Analytical papers, proposals, reports

- (2.1) Development of Requirement of Sustainable Community Forest Management Certification, Project proposal (en, bahasa)
- (2.2) Agenda of the public seminar on 6th October 2016; - Jogjakarta
- (2.3) Report on the public seminar on 6th October 2016
- (2.4) Report on the pilot audit (AJA Registrars)

3. Documentation relating to the SC

- (3.1) E-mail invitation to SC meeting (2nd August 2016)
- (3.2) Invitation letter to the SC meeting (2nd August 2016)
- (3.3) Minutes of the SC meeting (2nd August 2016)
- (3.4) E-mail invitation of the SC committee meeting (30th August 2016)
- (3.5) Invitation letter to SC meeting (30th August 2016)
- (3.6) Minutes of the SC meeting (30th August 2016)
- (3.7) E-mail invitation of the SC committee meeting (13th April 2017)
- (3.8) Invitation letter to SC meeting (13th April 2017)
- (3.9) Minutes of the SC meeting (13th April 2017)

4. Documentation relating to the DGW

- (4.1) E-mail invitation to DWG meeting (23-24th August 2016)
- (4.2) Invitation letter to the DWG meeting (23-24th August 2016)
- (4.3) Minutes of the DWG meeting (23-24th August 2016)
- (4.4) E-mail invitation to DWG meeting (16th March 2017)
- (4.5) Invitation letter to the DWG meeting (16th March 2017)
- (4.6) E-mail invitation to DWG meeting (31st March – 1st April 2017)
- (4.7) Minutes of the DWG meeting (31st March – 1st April 2017)
- (4.8) E-mail invitation to DWG meeting (9th June 2017)
- (4.9) Invitation letter to the DWG meeting (9th June 2017)
- (4.10) Minutes of the DWG meeting (9th June 2017)

5. Documentation relating to the IFCC BoD and the IFCC GA

- (5.1) Minutes of the IFCC BoD meeting on 2015-05-19
- (5.2) Minutes of the IFCC BoD meeting on 2017-04-17
- (5.3) Minutes of the IFCC BoD postal ballot on 21 – 27 July 2017
- (5.4) Minutes of the IFCC GA postal ballot on 18 - 25 April 2017

6. News, press-releases and communication

- (6.1) Announcement of the start of the annex 4 Standardization Committee process at the IFCC website: <http://ifcc-ksk.org/index.php/information/news-and-media/news/national-news?start=10>
- (6.2) Announcement of the public consultation at the IFCC website: <http://ifcc-ksk.org/index.php/information/news-and-media/news/national-news/507-konsultasi-publik-ifcc-community-forest>
- (6.3) Communication of the public consultation at the Rimbawan-interaktif
- (6.4) E-mail distribution of the public consultation to stakeholders (Sept 2016)
- (6.5) A letter to stakeholders (6 Sept 2016) with invitation to public consultation.
- (6.6) Announcement of extension period of the public consultation at IFCC website: <http://ifcc-ksk.org/index.php/information/news-and-media/news/national-news/512-perpanjangan-konsultasi-publik-ifcc-ifcc-community-forest>
- (6.7) Email distribution of extension period of the public consultation to stakeholders (28 Oct 2016)
- (6.8) Publication of the comments from the public consultation at IFCC website: <http://ifcc-ksk.org/index.php/information/news-and-media/news/national-news/557-rekap-masukan-pendapat-komentar-konsultasi-publik-ifcc-ifcc-community-forest>
- (6.9) Press release on formal approval and publication of the IFCC scheme documentation
- (6.10) Publication of the IFCC scheme documentation at the IFCC website
- (6.11) Publication of the standard setting report at the IFCC website

Annex 2: A list of the Drafting Working Group's members

Drafting Working Group

1	IR. DARU ASYCARYA, MM.	General aspect
2	HERMAN PRAYUDI	General aspect
3	Dr. Ir. TEDDY RUSOLONO, MS.	General aspect
4	CECEP SAEPULLOH	Production aspect
5	SERA NOVIANY	Production aspect
6	KURNIADI SUHERMAN	Production aspect
7	Dr. SOFYAN P. WARSITO	Production aspect
8	DIAN NOVARINA	Production aspect
9	Dr. Ir. HARNIOS ARIEF, M.ScF.	Ecological aspect
10	TAUFIK MARGANI	Ecological aspect
11	NURCAHYO ADI	IFCC team, Ecological aspect
12	Dr. DIDIK SUHARDJITO, MS.	Social aspect
13	Dr. CHRISTINE WULANDARI	Social aspect
14	WAHYU RIVA	Social aspect
15	RUDI SETYAWAN	ISO
16	RAGITA	IFCC team
17	HENY	IFCC team