

IFCC responses:

The IFCC action were taken to address the non-conformities that were found in the Community Forestry Standard.

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	4.1 The requirements for sustainable forest management defined by regional, national or sub-national forest management standards shall a) include management and performance requirements that are applicable at the forest management unit level, or at another level as appropriate, to ensure that the intent of all requirements is achieved at the forest management unit level.	
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	(none specific)	
Assessment outcome	<p>Does not conform – minor;</p> <p>“Many requirements specifically indicate the requirement shall be applied at MU level. However, the status of Annex 4 is not clear. It is uncertain whether Annex 4 is a complete set of requirements (separate standard) that replaces the requirements in the main FM standard, or that the requirements in Annex 4 are additional, and shall be applied on top of the requirements in the FM standard (IFCC ST 1001). In fact, no answer is found to the question: shall Community Forestry entities comply with requirements of both main FM standard and Annex 4, or do they only have to comply with the requirements of Annex 4? It is assumed the latter is the case, however, it is not clearly regulated in the standard / Scheme documentation.</p> <p>It is therefore not sufficiently ensured that the requirements as defined by the standards include requirements that ensure that the intent of <u>all</u> requirements is achieved at the forest management unit level”.</p>	
IFCC Action Taken	To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has added a chapter regarding “introduction” into Annex 4 that can be found on “After Amendment” column below.	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	--	<p>Introduction</p> <p>The requirement for Certification of Sustainable Community Forest Management are normatively referred to IFCC ST 1001 which has previously been endorsed by PEFC Council. However, because of the scale, intensity, and pattern of community forest management in Indonesia can not be compared with Management Unit IUPHHK-HA and or IUPHHK-HTI, therefore a number of IFCC ST 1001 requirements has been adjusted as Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001 (Amendment 1).</p> <p>Sustainable Community Forest Management Certification process specifically uses the Annex 4 IFCC ST 1001</p>

		(Amendment 1). Since Annex 4 is part of the IFCC ST 1001, this Annex remains inseparable part of the main standard IFCC ST 1001, where normative references, definitions, Annex 1, Annex 2, and Annex 3 in IFCC ST 1001 remain valid.
--	--	---

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	4.1 The requirements for sustainable forest management defined by regional, national or sub-national forest management standards shall b) be clear, objective-based and auditable.
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	(none specific)
Assessment outcome	<p>Does not conform – minor;</p> <p>The structure of Annex 4 of IFCC ST 1001 is clear and contains general requirements, requirements in case of management of natural forests and management of plantation forests. However, it is insufficiently clear for which cases Annex 4 applies, and as to which cases the main FM standard (IFCC ST 1001) shall be applied. The Scope and Definition of Annex 4 are as follows:</p> <p>“Scope:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All status and function of forest managed by community. 2. The level of community involvement in taking decision: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. It is reflected from the institution form of management unit (individual, farmer group and cooperative). b. It covers all aspects of forest management. c. It covers risk and benefit consideration. <p>Definition:</p> <p>Community forest - All forest management activities involving local communities intensively to produce timber and other forest products inside and outside the forest area.”</p> <p>The descriptions of the scope and definition in the standard remain vague, for example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No definition is provided for community; • The wording “all status and function of forest” remains unclear; • It is unclear how 2a (under scope) contributes to a threshold level; • In the definition, the wording “involving” and “intensively” are multi-interpretable, as large forest companies could also involve local communities without being a community forestry enterprise. <p>The scope and definition leave to much room for interpretation, and risks that it is being applied by non-intended forest companies. IFCC provided additional explanation on how the Scope and Definition should be interpreted, in which also reference is made to national legislation:</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “The scope of community forest covers all types of land status and types of forest functions that are managed by community / local people under national regulations. According to the Indonesian Forestry Law, community forests are forests grown on community owned land and on customary lands. Recently, the Government of Indonesia also issued rights for the community surrounding the state forest to manage state forests, such as Community Plantation Forest (Hutan Tanaman Rakyat), Community Forest for managing multi-purpose products (Hutan Kemasyarakatan), and Village Forest (Hutan Desa); • The standard requires active participation by the community in managing and taking decision with regards to planning, implementing and monitoring & evaluation activities. The level of community involvement shall be indicated by the type of institution of the management unit which can be individual, group of farmers and cooperatives; <p>The wording “inside and outside forest area” is chosen as in Indonesia, the term “forest area” is equal with state-owned forest. The terms “inside and outside forest area” are basically to describe that the community forest in Indonesia consists of the ones that are located in private forest (community owned-forest) and also the ones that are located in state-owned forest;”</p> <p>Although such clarifications add to the understanding of the Scope and Definition, these are not found in the standard documentation. The wording in the Scope and Definition insufficiently refer to the legal national forest classification system, nor to any applicable definition or interpretation of the words “community”, “involvement” and “intensively”.</p> <p>These multi-interpretable aspects of the scope and definition therefore remain.</p>
IFCC Action Taken	<p>To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has revised the Scope and Definition of Annex 4 that can be found below.</p> <p>Regarding Annex 4 - IFCC ST 1001, Scope 2.a: the Management Units (MUs) that can be certified are the individual / the farmer / community or farmer group or cooperative who are intimately involved in taking decision of all aspects of forest management (planning, land clearing, tree nursery, planting, maintaining, harvesting, check/monitoring, and evaluating) which include coverage on managing the risk and benefit.</p> <p>The classification of the institution form who reflected on scope 2.a are individual / community, farmer group or cooperative. If the MU is a private company, where the highest decision taking is made by the largest shareholder, then the MU is not classified as community forest.</p> <p>Below is the definition of each institution form according to relevant law and regulations in Indonesia:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Individual: the individual or family who can only have a maximum of 20 hectares of agricultural land (Act 56 Year 1960 regarding Determination of the Extents of Agricultural Land, Article 1)

	<p>2. Farmer group: a group of farmers that are formed on the basis of common interests, common conditions, environment (social, economic, resources) and familiarity to improve and develop members' businesses (Regulation of The Ministry of Agriculture No. 273/Kpts/OT.160/4/2007 regarding "Guidelines on Farmer Institutional Development").</p> <p>3. Cooperative: is a business entity consisting of individuals or legal entities based on the principle of cooperation as well as people's economic movement based on family principles (Act 25 Year 1992 regarding Cooperatives).</p>	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	<p>Scope:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All status and function of forest managed by community. 2. The level of community involvement in taking decision: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. It is reflected from the institution form of management unit (individual, farmer group and cooperative). b. It covers all aspects of forest management. c. It covers risk and benefit consideration. <p>Definition:</p> <p>Community forest - All forest management activities involving local communities intensively to produce timber and other forest products inside and outside the forest area.</p>	<p>Scope:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All forest are managed by community. 2. The level of community involvement in taking decision: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. It is reflected from the institution form of management unit (individual, farmer group or cooperative). b. It covers all aspects of forest management. c. It covers risk and benefit consideration. <p>Definition:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Community: local community and or indigenous people/community 1. Community forest: All forest management activities intimately involves communities to produce timber and other forest products to generate income, and to the activities of forest dwelling communities. 2. Community: local community and or indigenous people/community. 3. Indigenous people/community: community group who have inhabited particular territory before any other inhabitants, have their own identity, develop and implement their own social order (IFCC ST 1001). 4. Local Community: Group of people constituting a unity, inhabit a particular territory, and have a cultural identity of their origin (IFCC ST 1001).

<p>PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement</p>	<p>5.1.11 Conversion of forests to other types of land use, including conversion of primary forests to forest plantations, shall not occur unless in justified circumstances where the conversion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) is in compliance with national and regional policy and legislation relevant for land use and forest management and is a result of national or regional land-use planning governed by a governmental or other official authority including consultation with materially and directly interested persons and organisations; and b) entails a small proportion of forest type; and c) does not have negative impacts on threatened (including vulnerable, rare or endangered) forest ecosystems, culturally and socially significant areas, important habitats of threatened species or other protected areas; and d) makes a contribution to long-term conservation, economic, and social benefits.
<p>System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report</p>	<p>Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001, Section 2 Specific requirements for management of natural forest</p> <p>“1.1 The MU shall not convert forests to other land use, including conversion to plantation forests, except in the justifiable circumstances where:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) The conversion is in compliance with national legislation and land use planning and is permitted by the relevant authorities; and b) The conversion is necessary for building forest related infrastructure or for livelihood and welfare of local communities and provides long-term contribution to social, economic and environmental benefits; and c) The conversion does not occur on protected areas; environmentally and socially important biotopes; and d) The total area of the converted forests within the Management Unit does not represent more than 5 % of the total forest area of the Management Unit. <p>Note: The land use planning includes consultation with materially and directly interested stakeholders. If the land legal status is not classified as forest area (Other Land Use), the conversion restriction will not be applied.”</p> <p>Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001, Section 3 Specific requirements for management of plantation forest</p> <p>“1.1 The MU shall exclude from forest certification those plantation forests that have been established by conversion of primary as well as secondary forests after 31 December 2010 except those meeting the justified circumstances in Section III,1.2.</p> <p>1.2 The MU shall not convert: forest to non-forest land uses and natural forests to plantation forests; except in the justifiable circumstances where:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) The conversion is in compliance with national legislation and land use planning and is permitted by the relevant authorities; and b) The conversion is necessary for building forest-related infrastructure or for livelihood and welfare of local communities and provides long-term contribution to social, economic and environmental benefits; and c) The conversion does not occur on protected areas; environmentally and socially important biotops; and

	<p>d) The total area of the converted forests within the Management Unit does not represent more than 5 % of the total forest area of the Management Unit</p> <p>Note: If the land legal status is not classified as forest area (Other Land Use), the conversion restriction will not be applied."</p> <p>Act of the Republic of Indonesia, nr. 26 (2007), concerning Spatial Management Chapter VIII Rights, Obligation and Community's Role, Article 65:</p> <p>"1) The implementation of land use planning by the government is conducted by involving participation from the community;</p> <p>2) Community participation during the land use planning process as per mentioned on the above point (1) is implemented at least through the following activities:</p> <p>a. Participation in the development of land use planning;</p> <p>b. Participation in the land use;</p> <p>c. Participation in the control of land use."</p>	
Assessment outcome	<p>Does not conform – minor;</p> <p>The definition of forest according to PEFC ST 1003:2010 is '<i>Land spanning more than 0.5 hectares with trees higher than 5 metres and a canopy cover of more than 10 percent; or trees able to reach these thresholds in situ. Does not include land that is predominantly agricultural or under urban land use.</i>' The Note at clause 1.1d (in both Section 2 and Section 3) allows for conversion on land which is not (formally) classified as forest area. However, for PEFC such an exception is not allowed. All forested areas, whether formally classified as forest or not, shall remain forested, unless the requirements for conversion are met. The issue of non-forest land conversion into forest land is covered under requirement 5.1.12.</p>	
IFCC Action Taken	<p>To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has revised the Annex 4, Section 2, point I.1.1 and Section 3, point I.1.2, that can be found below.</p>	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	<p>Section II: Specific requirements for management of natural forest</p> <p>I General Requirements</p> <p>1.1 The MU shall not convert forests to other land use, including conversion to plantation forests, except in the justifiable circumstances where:</p> <p>a) The conversion is in compliance with national legislation and land use planning and is permitted by the relevant authorities; and</p> <p>b) The conversion is necessary for building forest related infrastructure or for livelihood and welfare of local communities and provides long-term contribution to social, economic and environmental benefits; and</p>	<p>Section II: Specific requirements for management of natural forest</p> <p>I General Requirements</p> <p>1.1 The MU shall not convert forests to other land use, including conversion to plantation forests, except in the justifiable circumstances where:</p> <p>a) The conversion is in compliance with national legislation and land use planning and is permitted by the relevant authorities; and</p> <p>b) The conversion is necessary for building forest related infrastructure or for livelihood and welfare of local communities and provides long-term contribution to social, economic and environmental benefits; and</p>

	<p>c) The conversion does not occur on protected areas; environmentally and socially important biotopes; and</p> <p>d) The total area of the converted forests within the Management Unit does not represent more than 5 % of the total forest area of the Management Unit.</p> <p>Note: The land use planning includes consultation with materially and directly interested stakeholders. If the land legal status is not classified as forest area (Other Land Use), the conversion restriction will not be applied.</p> <p>Section III: Specific requirements for management of plantation forest</p> <p>I General Requirements</p> <p>1.2 The MU shall not convert: forest to non-forest land uses and natural forests to plantation forests; except in the justifiable circumstances where:</p> <p>a) The conversion is in compliance with national legislation and land use planning and is permitted by the relevant authorities; and</p> <p>b) The conversion is necessary for building forest-related infrastructure or for livelihood and welfare of local communities and provides long-term contribution to social, economic and environmental benefits; and</p> <p>c) The conversion does not occur on protected areas; environmentally and socially important biotops; and</p> <p>d) The total area of the converted forests within the Management Unit does not represent more than 5 % of the total forest area of the Management Unit.</p> <p>Note: If the land legal status is not classified as forest area (Other Land Use), the conversion restriction will not be applied.</p>	<p>c) The conversion does not occur on protected areas; environmentally and socially important biotopes; and</p> <p>d) The total area of the converted forests within the Management Unit does not represent more than 5 % of the total forest area of the Management Unit.</p> <p>Note: The land use planning includes consultation with materially and directly interested stakeholders.</p> <p>Section III: Specific requirements for management of plantation forest</p> <p>I General Requirements</p> <p>1.2 The MU shall not convert: forest to non-forest land uses and natural forests to plantation forests; except in the justifiable circumstances where:</p> <p>a) The conversion is in compliance with national legislation and land use planning and is permitted by the relevant authorities; and</p> <p>b) The conversion is necessary for building forest-related infrastructure or for livelihood and welfare of local communities and provides long-term contribution to social, economic and environmental benefits; and</p> <p>c) The conversion does not occur on protected areas; environmentally and socially important biotops; and</p> <p>d) The total area of the converted forests within the Management Unit does not represent more than 5 % of the total forest area of the Management Unit.</p>
--	--	---

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	5.1.12 Conversion of abandoned agricultural and treeless land into forest land shall be taken into consideration, whenever it can add economic, ecological, social and/or cultural value.	
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	Additional explanation provided by IFCC “The condition of community forest in Indonesia shows that the conversion occurs on the non-forested area into forested area. There is no government regulation in Indonesia which prohibits the conversion of non-forested area into forested area. Areas designated for non-forest use would be better to be converted into plantations (forested areas).”	
Assessment outcome	Does not conform – minor; No reference was found in the standard that conversion of abandoned agricultural and treeless land into forest shall be taken into consideration, whenever it can add economic, ecological, social and/or cultural value.	
IFCC Action Taken	To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has added clause 2.4 in the Annex 4, that can be found below.	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	--	2.4 MU shall have a plan to carry out forest rehabilitation and/or afforestation on abandoned agricultural land, whenever it can add economic, environmental, social and cultural values.

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	5.2.7 Appropriate forest management practices such as reforestation and afforestation with tree species and provenances that are suited to the site conditions or the use of tending, harvesting and transport techniques that minimise tree and/or soil damages shall be applied. The spillage of oil during forest management operations or the indiscriminate disposal of waste on forest land shall be strictly avoided. Non-organic waste and litter shall be avoided, collected, stored in designated areas and removed in an environmentally-responsible manner.	
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001; Section 1 Requirements for Natural Forest and Plantation Forest 2.2 The management plan shall include at least the following data and information: d) Appropriate silviculture technique according to the characteristic and the condition of growth media; 6.1 The MU shall have a document of environmental study which contain analysis of potential impacts towards environment. 6.2 The MU shall implement the environmental management plan and carry out technical improvement of environmental management in a sustainable manner.	

6.4 The MU shall create and implement Documented Procedure to control the use of hazardous and toxic materials (B3) in an environmentally-friendly way.

4.3 The MU shall optimize the utilization of forest resources to ensure efficient production, to reduce waste and to minimize destruction due to logging activities.”

Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001, Section 2 Specific requirements for management of natural forest

“3.2 The MU shall carry out man-made reforestation by utilizing the origin species for enrichment, rehabilitation of degraded forest, ex-road, and unused tracks. The MU shall not utilize introduced species.”

Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001, Section 3 Specific requirements for management of plantation forest

“3.2 The MU shall carry out regeneration in plantation forest within the time and method that will not reduce the forest production capacity. The MU shall only use those introduced species, varieties and provenances whose impact on ecosystem and on its genetic integrity has been assessed and evaluated, and if negative impacts can be avoided or minimized.”

Additional explanation provided by IFCC

“Oil is considered as B3 – hazardous and toxic materials. The meaning of B3 is based on the Act Number 32 (2009) regarding environmental management and protection (...) and Government Regulation Number 101 (2014) regarding Management of Hazardous and Toxic Materials (B3) Waste.”

Act Number 32 (2009) regarding environmental management and protection

“B3 is a substance, energy, and / or other components due to the nature, concentration, and / or amount, either directly or indirectly, can pollute and / or damage the environment, and / or environmental harm, health, and survival of human beings and other living creatures.”

Government Regulation Number 101 (2014) regarding Management of Hazardous and Toxic Materials (B3) Waste; Chapter II, Article 3

“The B3 waste as per mentioned at point 2, based on its source, it consists of:

- a. B3 waste that is generated from non-specific source;
- b. B3 waste that is generated from expired B3, from spilled B3, from B3 that does not meet the disposal specification, from ex-used of B3 packaging; and
- c. B3 waste that is generated from specific source.”

Annex 1 of Government Regulation Number 101 (2014):

“The list of B3 waste, Waste code B1052: the waste of ex-used lubricant oil among others: ex-used hydrolic lubricant oil, ex-used machine lubricant oil, ex-used gear lubricant oil, ex-used lubrication oil, ex-used insulation lubricant oil, ex-used heat transmission lubricant oil, ex-used grit chambers lubricant oil, ex-used separator lubricant oil and/or its mixture.”

Assessment outcome	Does not conform – minor; It is insufficiently ensured that the avoidance, collection, storage and environmentally-responsible removal of non-organic waste and litter are covered under clauses 6.1 and 6.2.	
IFCC Action Taken	To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has added point 6.6 in the Annex 4, that can be found below.	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	--	6.6 MU shall develop and implement documented procedures for controlled use of B3 (Hazardous materials and Toxic), including its storage, handling, transport, use and disposal by competent personnel. MU shall avoid spillage of oil and indiscriminate disposal of waste and shall ensure that chemicals, containers, liquid and solid non-organic waste shall be disposed in an environmentally appropriate and legal manner at off-site locations.

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	5.2.11 The use of pesticides shall follow the instructions given by the pesticide producer and be implemented with proper equipment and training.	
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001; Section 1 Requirements for Natural Forest and Plantation Forest <p>“8.1 The MU shall have and implement Documented Procedure on environmentally-friendly control against forest resources threats/disturbance, such as: forest fire, illegal logging, illegal grazing, forest encroachment, animal hunting, pest and disease.”</p> <p>Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001, Section 2 Specific requirements for management of natural forest</p> <p>“3.3 The MU shall only use chemical pesticide in the nursery area and shall comply with the list of prohibited and restricted use of pesticide as stipulated by the regulation that is available in Annex 3 of this Standard.”</p> <p>Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001, Section 3 Specific requirements for management of plantation forest</p> <p>“3.3 The MU shall only use pesticides for the purposes of weed control and shall comply with the list of prohibited and restricted pesticides as stipulated by regulation that is available in Annex 3 of this Standard.”</p> <p>Annex 3, IFCC ST 1001</p> <p>“List of active ingredients that are prohibited for all fields of use of pesticides and active ingredients of pesticides that specified as restricted pesticides.”</p>	
Assessment outcome	Does not conform – minor; Although the use of pesticides is regulated in the quoted requirements, no reference is found that, once it is decided a pesticide has to be used, the application of pesticides	

	shall be done according to the instructions given by the pesticide producer and be implemented with proper equipment and training.	
IFCC Action Taken	To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has added point 8.4 and 8.5 in the Annex 4, that can be found below.	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	--	<p>8.4 MU shall adopt an integrated pest management programme that shall, where possible, apply environmentally friendly biological, non-chemical methods of pest management, and strive to minimise or avoid the use of chemical pesticides.</p> <p>8.5 MU shall establish and implement documented procedures for the use of chemical pesticides and or fertilizer that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. ensure compliance with legal requirements and pesticide producer's instructions; b. specify procedures for their storage, handling, transport, use and disposal; c. specify proper techniques, equipment and facilities for their use; d. require appropriate personnel competences and training.

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	5.2.12 Where fertilisers are used, they shall be applied in a controlled manner and with due consideration for the environment.	
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	Clarification provided by IFCC Secretariat "Most of the community forest in Indonesia is under supervision of Local Forestry Service (Local Government). As the Government they encourage community to utilize resources that are easily available surrounding their location, in this case is organic fertiliser."	
Assessment outcome	Does not conform – minor; Despite the clarification provided by the IFCC Secretariat, no reference was found in the standard (Annex 4 of IFCC ST 1001) that in a situation where fertilisers are used, either organic or mineral, they shall be applied in a controlled manner and with due consideration for the environment.	
IFCC Action Taken	To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has added point 8.5 in the Annex 4, that can be found below.	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	--	<p>8.5 MU shall establish and implement documented procedures for the use of chemical pesticides and or fertilizer that:</p>

		<p>a. ensure compliance with legal requirements and pesticide producer's instructions;</p> <p>b. specify procedures for their storage, handling, transport, use and disposal;</p> <p>c. specify proper techniques, equipment and facilities for their use;</p> <p>d. require appropriate personnel competences and training.</p>
--	--	--

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	5.3.2 Forest management planning shall aim to achieve sound economic performance taking into account any available market studies and possibilities for new markets and economic activities in connection with all relevant goods and services of forests.	
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	<p>Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001; Section 1 Requirements for Natural Forest and Plantation Forest</p> <p>2.1 MU shall have document of management plan as well as other related documents in accordance with classification of working area, which cover the sustainability of production, ecology and social functions. The management plan shall be revised if there are changes that affect the production, ecology and social functions.</p> <p>4.1 The MU shall arrange and maintain forest area according to its respected functions in order to ensure its long term business certainty.</p> <p>4.3 The MU shall optimize the utilization of forest resources to ensure efficient production, to reduce waste and to minimize destruction due to logging activities.”</p>	
Assessment outcome	<p>Does not conform – minor;</p> <p>Although the production function is covered in the management plan, no reference was found that the Forest management planning shall take into account any available market studies (e.g. made by others, such as research institutes) and possibilities for new markets and economic activities in connection with all relevant goods and services of forests.</p>	
IFCC Action Taken	To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has added point 1.15 in the Annex 4, that can be found below.	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	--	1.15 MU shall carry out or contribute in research and development (R&D) and data collection activities. MU shall adapt forest management based on the results of the R&D, the latest scientific knowledge, available market studies and new market opportunities publicly available.

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	5.3.6 Harvesting levels of both wood and non-wood forest products shall not exceed a rate that can be sustained in the long term, and optimum use shall be made of the harvested forest products, with due regard to nutrient off-take.	
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001; Section 1 Requirements for Natural Forest and Plantation Forest “4.3 The MU shall optimize the utilization of forest resources to ensure efficient production, to reduce waste and to minimize destruction due to logging activities. 5.1 The MU shall ensure that the rate of forest product (wood) harvesting will not exceed the rate of sustainable harvesting. 5.2 The MU shall avoid or minimize negative impact of its activities towards the existence of nonwood products to guarantee diversification of outputs, goods and services, and vice versa.”	
Assessment outcome	Does not conform – minor; Although harvesting levels of wood and non-wood forest products are regulated in case of natural and plantation forests, no reference was found that this is done with due regard to nutrient off-take. Minimization of destruction (req. 4.3) does insufficiently ensure that nutrient off-take is taken into account. No increased importance to this topic was given in case of plantation forestry, as required according to Appendix 1 of PEFC ST 1003: Guidelines for the interpretation of requirements in the case of plantation forestry.	
IFCC Response	To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has revised the Annex 4, point 4.3 that can be found below.	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	4.3 The MU shall optimize the utilization of forest resources to ensure efficient production, to reduce waste and to minimize destruction due to logging activities.	4.3 The MU shall optimize the utilization of forest resources to ensure efficient production, to reduce waste, minimize destruction due to harvesting activities and minimize nutrient off-take. Tending & harvesting operations shall be conducted in a way that does not cause lasting damage to ecosystems.

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	5.3.7 Where it is the responsibility of the forest owner/manager and included in forest management, the exploitation of non-timber forest products, including hunting and fishing, shall be regulated, monitored and controlled.	
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001; Section 1 Requirements for Natural Forest and Plantation Forest “3.2 The monitoring and evaluation shall cover: c) All harvested forest products (wood and nonwood products) (...) e) The functions of forests for the customary and community social-economic	

	<p>purposes;</p> <p>3.3 The MU shall integrate the result of monitoring and evaluation into the future management plan.</p> <p>5.2 The MU shall avoid or minimize negative impact of its activities towards the existence of nonwood products to guarantee diversification of outputs, goods and services, and vice versa.”</p>	
Assessment outcome	<p>Does not conform – minor;</p> <p>No reference was found that nonwood products include hunting and fishing.</p>	
IFCC Action Taken	<p>To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has revised the Annex 4, point 3.2, that can be found below.</p>	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	<p>4.3 The MU shall optimize the utilization of forest resources to ensure efficient production, to reduce waste and to minimize destruction due to logging activities.</p>	<p>3.2 The monitoring and evaluation shall cover:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Stock and level of forest growth; b) Forest regeneration; c) All harvested forest products (wood and non-wood products including hunting and fishing); implementation of chain of custody; the efficiency of forest utilization; d) The functions of soil and water conservation; e) The functions of forests for the customary and community social-economic purposes; f) Pest and disease, forest fire and illegal activities.

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	<p>5.4.2 Forest management planning, inventory and mapping of forest resources shall identify, protect and/or conserve ecologically important forest areas containing significant concentrations of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) protected, rare, sensitive or representative forest ecosystems such as riparian areas and wetland biotopes; b) areas containing endemic species and habitats of threatened species, as defined in recognised reference lists; c) endangered or protected genetic in situ resources; and taking into account d) globally, regionally and nationally significant large landscape areas with natural distribution and abundance of naturally occurring species.
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	<p>Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001; Section 1 Requirements for Natural Forest and Plantation Forest</p> <p>“1.14 The MU shall plan, define and maintain adequate infrastructure, such as roads, skidding tracks, bridges, camp, etc. to:</p>

	<p>b) minimize the damage to the ecosystem, species and their genetic resources, specifically endangered species, including areas that are pathways of migration of specific species.</p> <p>7.1 The MU shall identify, maintain and improve the habitats of protected, endemic flora and fauna, and endangered species.</p> <p>7.2 The UM shall conduct inventory and mapping out the protected, sensitive and endangered forest ecosystem or the representation of ecosystem, such as: riparian, wetland biotope in accordance with the scale and intensity of its forest management.”</p> <p>Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001; Section 3 Specific requirements for management of plantation forest</p> <p>“3.1 The MU shall identify and undertake maintenance and/or construction of wildlife corridor which connect forested area and/or wildlife protection/preservation within the forest area and outside the forest area.”</p>	
Assessment outcome	<p>Does not conform – minor;</p> <p>No reference was found that the landscape aspect and natural distribution and occurrence shall be taken into account. Furthermore, the protection of endangered or protected genetic in situ resources is only covered in case of construction of infrastructure, no reference is found that this is also done in other areas of the MU. Identification, protection and / or conservation of ecologically important forest areas shall be covered in the forest management planning, regardless of the main function of the MU or the official classification set by the authorities.</p>	
IFCC Action Taken	To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has revised the Annex 4, point 2.2, that can be found below.	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	<p>2.2 The management plan shall include at least the following data and information:</p> <p>a) Vision, mission and the objectives of forest management;</p> <p>b) History of forest utilization and recent development;</p> <p>c) Community social-culture;</p> <p>d) Appropriate silviculture technique according to the characteristic and the condition of growth media ;</p> <p>e) Growth information;</p> <p>f) Level of sustainable harvesting;</p> <p>g) Environmental management and monitoring plans, forest protection and security plan shall consist of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prevention and protection against forest fire; • Prevention and eradication of 	<p>2.2 The management plan shall include at least the following data and information:</p> <p>a) Vision, mission and the objectives of forest management;</p> <p>b) History of forest utilization and recent development;</p> <p>c) Community social-culture;</p> <p>d) Appropriate silviculture technique according to the characteristic and the condition of growth media ;</p> <p>e) Growth information;</p> <p>f) Level of sustainable harvesting;</p> <p>g) Environmental management and monitoring plans, forest protection and security plan shall consist of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prevention and protection against forest fire; • Prevention and eradication of illegal logging;

	illegal logging; • Prevention and protection against crop pest and disease; • Conservation of soil and water; • Protection towards flora, fauna and germplasm; • Handling of land-shift cultivation; h) Work maps. i) The construction and maintenance of infrastructure, such as: roads, camps, bridges, etc.	• Prevention and protection against crop pest and disease; • Conservation of soil and water; • Protection towards flora, fauna and germplasm; • Handling of land-shift cultivation; • Landscape aspect and natural distribution; • Identification, protection and / or conservation of ecologically important forest areas. h) Work maps. i) The construction and maintenance of infrastructure, such as: roads, camps, bridges, etc.
--	--	--

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	5.4.3 Protected and endangered plant and animal species shall not be exploited for commercial purposes. Where necessary, measures shall be taken for their protection and, where relevant, to increase their population.	
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001; Section 1 Requirements for Natural Forest and Plantation Forest “Criterion 7 Biodiversity Management 7.1 The MU shall identify, maintain and improve the habitats of protected, endemic flora and fauna, and endangered species. 7.2 The UM shall conduct inventory and mapping out the protected, sensitive and endangered forest ecosystem or the representation of ecosystem, such as: riparian, wetland biotope in accordance with the scale and intensity of its forest management.”	
Assessment outcome	Does not conform – minor; No reference was found that protected and endangered plant and animal species shall not be exploited for commercial purposes.	
IFCC Action Taken	To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has revised the Annex 4, point 7.1, that can be found below:	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	7.1 The MU shall identify, maintain and improve the habitats of protected, endemic flora and fauna, and endangered species.	7.1 The MU shall identify, maintain and improve the habitats of protected, endemic flora and fauna, and endangered species. Endangered and protected species shall not be exploited for commercial purposes.

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	5.4.10 Tending and harvesting operations shall be conducted in away that does not cause lasting damage to ecosystems. Wherever possible, practical measures shall be taken to improve or maintain biological diversity.	
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001; Section 1 Requirements for Natural Forest and Plantation Forest “4.3 The MU shall optimize the utilization of forest resources (...) to minimize destruction due to logging activities. 6.1 The MU shall have a document of environmental study which contain analysis of potential impacts towards environment. 6.2 The MU shall implement the environmental management plan and carry out technical improvement of environmental management in a sustainable manner. 7.1 The MU shall identify, maintain and improve the habitats of protected, endemic flora and fauna, and endangered species. 7.2 The UM shall conduct inventory and mapping out the protected, sensitive and endangered forest ecosystem or the representation of ecosystem, such as: riparian, wetland biotope in accordance with the scale and intensity of its forest management.”	
Assessment outcome	Does not conform – minor; Insufficient reference was found which ensures that tending shall be conducted in a way that does not cause lasting damage to ecosystems. Furthermore, no reference was found that practical measures shall be taken to improve or maintain biological diversity in general (not only for protected, endemic and endangered species).	
IFCC Action Taken	To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has revised the Annex 4, point 4.3, that can be found below:	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	4.3 The MU shall optimize the utilization of forest resources to ensure efficient production, to reduce waste and to minimize destruction due to logging activities.	4.3 The MU shall optimize the utilization of forest resources to ensure efficient production, to reduce waste, minimize destruction due to harvesting activities and minimize nutrient off-take. Tending & harvesting operations shall be conducted in a way that does not cause lasting damage to ecosystems.

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	5.4.13 Standing and fallen dead wood, hollow trees, old groves and special rare tree species shall be left in quantities and distribution necessary to safeguard biological diversity, taking into account the potential effect on the health and stability of forests and on surrounding ecosystems.	
System requirement(s)	Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001; Section 1 Requirements for Natural Forest and Plantation Forest	

Final Assessment Report	<p>“7.1 The MU shall identify, maintain and improve the habitats of protected, endemic flora and fauna, and endangered species.</p> <p>7.2 The UM shall conduct inventory and mapping out the protected, sensitive and endangered forest ecosystem or the representation of ecosystem, such as: riparian, wetland biotope in accordance with the scale and intensity of its forest management.”</p>	
Assessment outcome	<p>Does not conform – minor;</p> <p>No specific reference was found that regulates leaving dead wood, hollow trees, old groves and special rare tree species, for the purpose of biological diversity, taking into account the potential effect on the health and stability of forests and surrounding ecosystems. Although the improvement of habitats (clause 7.1) might include these types of activities, it is insufficiently ensured, and it is furthermore only related to protected, endemic, and endangered flora and fauna, and misses the scope to safeguard biological diversity in general.</p> <p>Furthermore, no provisions are foreseen in the case of plantation forestry, to consider this requirement to take place in buffer zones and set-aside areas, which complement stands of fast growing trees, and which are dedicated to environmental, ecological, cultural and social, as described in Appendix 1 of PEFC ST 1003.</p>	
IFCC Action Taken	To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has added point 7.2 in the Annex 4, that can be found below.	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	7.2 The UM shall conduct inventory and mapping out the protected, sensitive and endangered forest ecosystem or the representation of ecosystem, such as: riparian, wetland biotope in accordance with the scale and intensity of its forest management.	7.2 MU shall leave Standing and fallen dead wood, hollow trees, old groves and special rare tree species in quantities and distribution necessary to safeguard biological diversity, taking into account the potential effect on the health and stability of forests and on surrounding ecosystems.

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	<p>5.5.3 Special care shall be given to silvicultural operations on sensitive soils and erosion-prone areas as well as in areas where operations might lead to excessive erosion of soil into watercourses. Inappropriate techniques such as deep soil tillage and use of unsuitable machinery shall be avoided in such areas. Special measures shall be taken to minimise the pressure of animal populations.</p>	
System requirement(s)	<p>Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001; Section 1 Requirements for Natural Forest and Plantation Forest</p>	
Final Assessment Report	<p>“4.3 The MU shall optimize the utilization of forest resources (...) to minimize destruction due to logging activities.</p> <p>6.1 The MU shall have a document of environmental study which contain analysis of potential impacts towards environment.</p> <p>6.2 The MU shall implement the environmental management plan and carry out technical improvement of environmental management in a sustainable manner.</p>	

	<p>6.3 The MU shall carry out periodic monitoring in accordance with the type of impacts identified from the forest management activity. The result of the monitoring activity shall be used in developing the next management plan.</p> <p>8.1 The MU shall have and implement Documented Procedure on environmentally-friendly control against forest resources threats/disturbance, such as: (...) illegal grazing (...)</p> <p>8.2 The MU shall cooperate with other community members to minimize threats/disturbance against forest resources.”</p>	
Assessment outcome	<p>Does not conform – minor;</p> <p>Although the environmental management plan (req. 6.2) might cover silvicultural operations on sensitive soils and erosion-prone areas, no explicit reference was found to ensure that silvicultural operations on sensitive soils and erosion-prone areas shall be carried out with specialcare, and that inappropriate techniques shall be avoided in such areas.</p>	
IFCC Action Taken	<p>To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has changed the requirement 6.3 of the Annex 4 to be the requirement 6.4, and added a new requirement on 6.3 that can be found below.</p>	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	<p>6.3 The MU shall carry out periodic monitoring in accordance with the type of impacts identified from the forest management activity. The result of the monitoring activity shall be used in developing the next management plan.</p>	<p>6.3 MU shall give special care to silvicultural operations on sensitive soils and erosion-prone areas as well as in areas where operations might lead to excessive erosion of soil into watercourses. Inappropriate techniques such as deep soil tillage and use of unsuitable machinery shall be avoided in such areas. Special measures shall be taken to minimise the pressure of animal populations.</p> <p>6.4 The MU shall carry out periodic monitoring in accordance with the type of impacts identified from the forest management activity. The result of the monitoring activity shall be used in developing the next management plan.</p>

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	<p>5.5.4 Special care shall be given to forest management practices in forest areas with water protection functions to avoid adverse effects on the quality and quantity of water resources. Inappropriate use of chemicals or other harmful substances or inappropriate silvicultural practices influencing water quality in a harmful way shall be avoided.</p>
System	Annex 4, IFCC ST 1001; Section 1 Requirements for Natural Forest and

<p>requirement(s)</p> <p>Final Assessment Report</p>	<p>Plantation Forest</p> <p>“1.2 The MU shall comply with relevant regulations subject to scale and intensity of its forest management.</p> <p>2.2 The management plan shall include at least the following data and information:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">g) Environmental management and monitoring plans, forest protection and security plan shall consist of:</p> <p style="padding-left: 80px;">• Conservation of soil and water;</p> <p>6.1 The MU shall have a document of environmental study which contain analysis of potential impacts towards environment.</p> <p>6.2 The MU shall implement the environmental management plan and carry out technical improvement of environmental management in a sustainable manner.</p> <p>6.3 The MU shall carry out periodic monitoring in accordance with the type of impacts identified from the forest management activity. The result of the monitoring activity shall be used in developing the next management plan.</p> <p>7.2 The UM shall conduct inventory and mapping out the protected, sensitive and endangered forest ecosystem or the representation of ecosystem, such as: riparian, wetland biotope in accordance with the scale and intensity of its forest management.</p> <p>8.2 The MU shall cooperate with other community members to minimize threats/disturbance against forest resources.”</p> <p>Government Regulation (PP) Number 26 (2008) regarding National Spatial Land Use Plan</p> <p>“Article 50</p> <p>The national spatial plan consists of:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">a. National protection areas; and</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">b. Cultivation areas that have national strategic value.</p> <p>Article 51</p> <p>The national protection areas consist of: (...) e. the geological protection areas,</p> <p>Article 52 – 5c</p> <p>The geological protection area consists of:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">a. The area of geological reserve;</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">b. The area that is high risk for geological natural disaster;</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">c. The area that provide protection against ground water.</p> <p>Article 53 – 3</p> <p>The areas that provide protection against ground water as per mentioned at article 52 point 5c consist of:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">a. Recharge zone areas;</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">b. Boundary of springs.</p>
--	--

	<p>Article 62 – 2</p> <p>The areas of boundary of springs as per mentioned at Article 53 – 3b, is stipulated by the following criteria:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">a. The mainland surrounding the springs which provide benefit to maintain the function of springs;</p> <p>A territory that is located minimum 200 meters from the springs. “</p>	
Assessment outcome	<p>Does not conform – minor;</p> <p>Although the Government regulation does refer to ground water areas and springs, this was not supported with explicit protection measures, such as avoidance of inappropriate use of chemicals or other harmful substances or inappropriate silvicultural practices.</p>	
IFCC Action Taken	<p>To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has added point 6.5 in the Annex 4, that can be found below:</p>	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	--	<p>6.5 MU shall give special care to forest management practices in forest areas with water protection functions to avoid adverse effects on the quality and quantity of water resources. Inappropriate use of chemicals or other harmful substances or inappropriate silvicultural practices influencing water quality in a harmful way shall be avoided.</p>

PEFC ST 1003:2010 Requirement	<p>5.6.14 Forest management shall be based inter-alia on the results of scientific research. Forest management shall contribute to research activities and data collection needed for sustainable forest management or support relevant research activities carried out by other organisations, as appropriate.</p>	
System requirement(s) Final Assessment Report	<p>Additional explanation provided by IFCC</p> <p>“Due to cost and skill constraints, the research is not possible to be done by the community. Therefore, the community can use the result of the research conducted by other institutions.”</p>	
Assessment outcome	<p>Does not conform – minor;</p> <p>No reference was found that forest management shall be based on the results of (publicly available) scientific research and that forest management shall contribute to research activities. ‘Contribute’ does not necessarily mean the MU shall bear (part of) the research costs.</p>	
IFCC Action Taken	<p>To address the assessment outcome, IFCC has added point 1.15 in the Annex 4, that can be found below:</p>	
Revised system requirement(s)	Before Amendment	After Amendment
	--	<p>1.15 MU shall carry out or contribute in research and development (R&D) and data collection activities. MU shall</p>

		adapt forest management based on the results of the R&D, the latest scientific knowledge, available market studies and new market opportunities publicly available.
--	--	---